https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n0/mode/1up

2017-12 -Has Kalki Already Appeared as Ali (1245)

All Items on https://archive.org/details/realpatidar

tidar.com

Has Kalki Already Appeared as ʿAlī? The Influence of Hindu Beliefs on the Nizārī Ismaili Khojas: A Case Study of the Ginans

Full Library on https://realpatidar.com/library

CEMIL KUTLUTURK

Assistant Professor, Faculty of Divinity, Ankara University, Turkey.

ABSTRACT: The Historical Interaction of Hinduism and Islam since the seventh century has witnessed periods of cooperation and syncretism. In this sense the Khojas, who were the main representatives of Nizārī Ismaili thought in India, are a unique model as they were influenced by Hindu customs and beliefs, particularly Vaishnava terminologies. For instance, the Hindu concept of Kalki avatara, the messianic tenth incarnation of Vishnu, renamed in this tradition as Nakalanki, 'the stainless one', was identified with ʿAlī, the first Shiite Imam. Therefore, an attempt is made in this article to disclose the influence of Hindu terms and doctrines on the Nizārī Khojas by focusing on their religious texts, Ginans, which were composed by dāʿīs, the so-called propagators of this sect. This paper also deals with the historical development of Khoja community in India where the second-largest Shi'a population in the world is located.

KEYWORDS: Ginan, Hindu-Muslim interaction, India, imamah, Nizārī Ismaili Khojas, Shi'a, syncretism.

Introduction

The Ismāʿīliyyah is a Shiite sect whose adherents believe that Ismāʿīl ibn Jaʿfar, son of the sixth Imam (spiritual leader) Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq, was the rightful seventh Imam after him. The information about the early period of the Ismāʿīliyyah, which covers the period from the death of Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq to the establishment of the Fatimid State, is quite limited. In this process, the Ismaili thought spread to different regions such as Iran,

realpatidar.com

Link: http://www.realpatidar.com/library
email: mail@realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n1/mode/1up

Real Patidar Library

https://www.realpatidar.com/library

This book/literature/article/material may be used for research, teaching, and private study purposes. Any substantial or systematic reproduction, redistribution, reselling, loan, sub-licensing, systematic supply, or distribution in any form to anyone is expressly forbidden.

The library does not give any warranty express or implied or make any representation that the contents will be complete or accurate or up to date. The library shall not be liable for any loss, actions, claims, proceedings, demand, or costs or damages whatsoever or howsoever caused arising directly or indirectly in connection with or arising out of the use of this material.

Full terms and conditions of use: http://www.realpatidar.com

About Real Patidar books

Real Patidar's mission is to organize the information on Satpanth religion, which is a Nizari Ismaili sect of Shia branch of Islam, and to make it universally accessible and useful. Real Patidar Books helps readers discover the material on Satpanth online while helping authors and researchers in their studies. You can know more by visiting http://www.realpatidar.com

You can resize and move this box in any PDF Application like Adobe Acrobat Reader.

No specific pages. See whole book.
References by: RealPatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n2/mode/1up

2017-12 -Has Kalki Already Appeared as Ali (1245)

realpatidar.com

Has Kalki Already Appeared as ʿAlī? The Influence of Hindu Beliefs on the Nizārī Ismaili Khojas: A Case Study of the Ginans

CEMIL KUTLUTURK

Assistant Professor, Faculty of Divinity, Ankara University, Turkey.

ABSTRACT: The Historical Interaction of Hinduism and Islam since the seventh century has witnessed periods of cooperation and syncretism. In this sense the Khojas, who were the main representatives of Nizārī Ismaili thought in India, are a unique model as they were influenced by Hindu customs and beliefs, particularly Vaishnava terminologies. For instance, the Hindu concept of Kalki avatara, the messianic tenth incarnation of Vishnu, renamed in this tradition as Nakalanki, 'the stainless one', was identified with ʿAlī, the first Shiite Imam. Therefore, an attempt is made in this article to disclose the influence of Hindu terms and doctrines on the Nizārī Khojas by focusing on their religious texts, Ginans, which were composed by dāʿīs, the so-called propagators of this sect. This paper also deals with the historical development of Khoja community in India where the second-largest Shi'a population in the world is located.

KEYWORDS: Ginan, Hindu-Muslim interaction, India, imamah, Nizārī Ismaili Khojas, Shi'a, syncretism.

Introduction

The Ismāʿīliyyah is a Shiite sect whose adherents believe that Ismāʿīl ibn Jaʿfar, son of the sixth Imam (spiritual leader) Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq, was the rightful seventh Imam after him. The information about the early period of the Ismāʿīliyyah, which covers the period from the death of Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq to the establishment of the Fatimid State, is quite limited. In this process, the Ismaili thought spread to different regions such as Iran,

realpatidar.com

Link: http://www.realpatidar.com/library
email: mail@realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n3/mode/1up

realpatidar.com

Kufa, Yemen, and Bahrain through dāʿīs, the propagators of this sect. The historical sources reveal that in the period of the Fatimid Dynasty (910-1171), the sect split into two subgroups named Mustʿali and Nizārī.

A much more serious controversy among the adherents of the Ismāʿīliyyah took place following the death of Imam al-Mustanṣir in 1094. After it, the Ismailis who supported and acknowledged al-Mustanṣir's eldest son (Nizar) as the new Imam were called as Nizārīs, while those who affirmed Nizar's younger brother al-Mustʿali as his successor, came to be known as Mustʿalis. Even though both of them possessed a common Fatimid heritage, their histories evolved in different aspects because of environmental conditions especially in India (al- Makdisi 1906: 4821-482; Khan 1975:49).

The Mustʿali thought arrived at the Indian subcontinent through the dāʿīs who settled first in Yemen and before migrating to India after the weakening of the Fatimid Dynasty (Tan 2012: 125). Due to the inadequacy of historical data and the tightly sealed structure of this sect, it is not easy to uncover who was the first dāʿī settling on the Indian subcontinent, however, it is clear that Yūsuf b. Sulaymān's departure from Yemen to Gujarat in 1539 played a significant Those who accepted Mustʿali Ismāʿīliyyah in India were generally known as 'Bohras', a vernacular term derived from vehru or vohorvu referring to individuals who are engaged in trade (Najam al-Ghani 1924: 311).

The advent of Nizārī Ismaili dawa (invitation, issuing a summons) into the Indian subcontinent, on the other hand, was associated with various pīrs (spiritual leaders, Sufi teachers) and sayyids (an honorific title for a descendant of the family of Prophet Muhammad, Islamic title of respect) who were sent to this area by Ismaili Imams (religious leaders) residing in Iran to teach of Ismaili doctrines.

Sayyid Nūr al-Dīn who arrived from Alamut in the twelfth century has mostly been regarded by Nizārī Ismailis as their first missionary in India. He was later renamed as Satgur, which means 'true guide' in Hindi, and became famous as Satgur Nūr among Nizārīs. The Nizārī Ismaili dawa, therefore, was introduced into the Indian subcontinent during the first half of the thirteenth century. After Satgur Nūr, Pīr Shams ad-Dīn followed as the second dāʿī to spread this dawa in India. He, according to the traditional lyric, was assigned to this sacred duty at the beginning

realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n4/mode/1up

2017-12 -Has Kalki Already Appeared as Ali (1245)

realpatidar.com

of the thirteenth century by Ḳasim Shah, the twenty-ninth Imam of Nizārīs (Faridi 1899: 40) . After him, his grandson Pīr Sadr al-Dīn took the helm of the sect. The Shiite community dealt with in our study is Nizārī Ismā'īliyyah, which is known as Khojas and has gained a certain structural characteristic in India with the advent of Pīr Sadr al-Dīn .

Ismaili Khojas / Satpanthis

The activities of Pīr Sadr al-Dīn , as well as the religious and cultural structure of the region in which Nizārī Ismailis were located, played an important role in the development of the Khoja community, who were south Asian descendants of converts to the Nizārī Ismaili dawa. The term Khoja comes from the Persian title of respect, khwaja, meaning 'lord' or 'master' and is believed to have been bestowed by Ismaili teachers upon their converts in South Asia. Pīr Sadr al-Dīn converted large numbers of Hindus from the Lohana trading caste and gave them the title of 'Khoja', corresponding to the Hindi term thakur by which the Hindu Lohanas were addressed (Boivin 2010: 27; Jairazbhoy 2004: 252).

The Khojas, hence, are said to be disciples of Sadr al-Dīn , one of the most prominent pīrs of the Khoja tradition who lived in fifteenth century. Their community and many scholars believe that the Khojas were a specialized subgroup, while Pīr Sadr al-Dīn appears to have played a key role in organizing and consolidating the Satpanth tradition in India. He is in fact, accepted as the founder of the Nizārī Khoja community in the Indian subcontinent. The greatest number of the Ginans (hymn-like poems) are attributed to him. Moreover, it is believed that Khoji script, which is a secretive alphabet for recording religious texts and keeping commercial accounts, was founded by him (Asani, 1991: 104).

According to tradition, it is also acknowledged that the first jamaat khana (community house) for the religious and societal activities of the Khojas has been built by him in Sind. In the course of time, Sadr al-Dīn preached and conveyed his messages in Panjab and Kashmir by constructing various jamaat khanas. He took great care to ensure that the jamaat khanas, apart from being places of worship, also served as centers of social, administrative, cultural, legal and family affairs for the community. He, therefore, laid the foundations of the Nizārī communal

realpatidar.com

Link: http://www.realpatidar.com/library
email: mail@realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n5/mode/1up

realpatidar.com

organization in India, where the Nizārī Ismailis became generally designated as Khojas, in order to gain all practical goals (Daftary 1998: 178-180).

Pīr Sadr al-Dīn ensured that the members of the congregation were tightly interlocked and encouraged them to remain attached to the Imam-e Zamaan (spiritual leader of the age). He imposed that this commitment should be shown not only verbally but practically. The hymns attributed to him such as 'All gave the exact offering of tithe and became purified and pious' (Pīr Sadr al-Dīn , 105:7) , reveal that he initiated the customary tithe, an offering to the Imam called as dasond among members of the community. He, on the other hand, considered the customs, beliefs, and cultures of his subjects when he communicated his message and in this regard, he adopted the local name, Sahadev, which means 'with God' (Williams 2008: 1743), to refer to himself. In our opinion, through such a method he wished to convey to his counterparts the idea that he was appointed for a divine mission.

After the death of Pīr Sadr al-Dīn in Uch, a region in Punjab state, his eldest sons Sayyid Ḥasan Kabīr ad-Dīn (d. 1449), Taj ad-Dīn (d. 1476) and ʿAbdu-r-Rahīm b. al-Ḥasan (d.1512) were regarded as the most eminent dāʿīs of the dawa. They strove to convey the messages of the dawa to different parts of India until the end of their life, however after them; in particular during the period of Nūr Muhammad, a number of debates arose over whether the taxes collected from members of the congregation should be sent to the Imam. A small group, who did not accept to send the tithes to the Imam, left from Khojas and became known as Imamshahis (Ivanow 1936: 43-44).

Periodically, many spiritual leaders came after Ṣadr al-Dīn and gradually, some debates occurred among the members of this sect, in particular after the arrival of the Aga Khan Ḥasan ʿAlī Shah from Iran to India in the mid-nineteenth century. One of the most important demonstrations of Khoja protest against their Imam was the giving of tithes. His arrival to India caused a revitalization of the earlier problem about the rights of the Imam within the Khoja community. Those who refused to pay dasond, were excluded from the congregation by the Aga Khan himself as well as by judges of the court who made some decisions in favor of the Aga Khan. Due to these kinds of events, the Khoja community was divided into three groups. They eventually took

realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n6/mode/1up

2017-12 -Has Kalki Already Appeared as Ali (1245)

realpatidar.com

the form of three different jamaats: the Sunni Khojas, who are very few, the Ithna Ashari (Twelver) Khojas and the majority Nizārī Ismaili Khojas, followers of the Aga Khan. Those Khojas who proclaimed to no longer work within the main Khoja community, declared themselves to be Sunni and became known as Sunni Khojas or to be Ithnā ʿAshari and were called as Twelver Khojas. The latter, by establishing their own group in Bombay, spread throughout the Khoja world as new jamaats were formed (Hickling 1998: 52-53; Akhtar 2015: 35-41).

The dāʿīs, pīrs, and sayyids have deeply learned the vernaculars, beliefs, and cultures of their counterparts in order to reach the masses. By utilizing religious terms and symbols that were familiar to Indian society, they aimed to draw more attention to their teachings. These eclectic attitudes have also allowed them to acquire supporters and become invincible. They preferred the Sanskrit term Satpanth, which means 'the true path, the right doctrine' while referring to their teachings. Their followers, thus, identified themselves as Satpanthis rather than Ismailis (Daftary 1998: 348). They emphasized the importance of joining the Nizārī Ismaili tradition by expressing that those who do not accept the Satpanth teachings will be exposed to various troubles and cannot reach salvation (Pīr Shams ad-Dīn , 105:13-14). They have explained such ideas through the Ginans, which are sacred songs or religious texts of Khojas.

Scholars such as ʿAlī Asani, Noorally Muir, W. Ivanow and Tazim Kassam have conducted important research on these texts, particularly concerning historical, linguistic, and contextual materials. The primary aim of this article, however, is to explore the impact of Hindu belief and culture on Khojas by revealing Indic doctrines, terminologies, metaphors and motifs used or transported in the Ginans especially in Dasa Avatara, attributed to the three important pīrs of the Khojas. Thereby, we hope to forge a broader understanding of the mutual interaction between both traditions. Hence, along with the Khojas' main doctrines, its evaluation in the process of history and position in the contemporary world is not handled in this study.

realpatidar.com

Link: http://www.realpatidar.com/library
email: mail@realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n7/mode/1up

realpatidar.com

The Ginans: A brief analysis

The term Ginan is derived from the Sanskrit word cnana/gyana for 'knowledge', in the sense of esoteric truth or wisdom; hence, the Ginans may be best understood as hymns of esoteric wisdom. The term Ginan itself also refers to any song or recitation (Nanji 1978: 106). This word phonetically is similar to Hindi word gana which means 'song, tune or to sing' and the Arabic word, gina, meaning 'singing or exhilarant word' (Ibn Manzur, 140). The core concepts of Khoja tradition in the Ginans were translated by pīrs or sayyids according to religious discourses or idioms prevalent in western India. The selection of the terms employed varied, depending on various factors such as the period of composition, doctrinal and thematic content, and the historical context of the audience. Therefore, it is known that the formulation of Khoja doctrines in the Ginans was stratified in character (Asani 1996: 270).

Various historical and regional elements shaped the character of different Ginans. Therefore, the religious and social characteristics of the Indian subcontinent, where this religious sect flourished, played an important role in the process of the development of these texts. It is known that the Nizārī dawa in India was addressed mainly to the rural, and largely uneducated, lower castes. Hence, the pīrs firstly focused on Indian vernaculars, rather than Arabic and Persian used by the educated classes, in order to enhance the effectiveness and spread of their message (Ivanow 1948: 32). For this reason, they used Hindu doctrines, vocabularies, idioms, and mythology, interfacing their Islamic and Ismaili tenets with myths, images, and symbols already familiar to the Hindus. In other words, the pīrs adopted a strategy of accommodating indigenous religious doctrines and concepts in order to reach the Hindu community whose social life was restricted by the caste system. As a result of this strategy, many Hindus, who mostly belong to the lower castes, were won over.

In time, Nizārī Khojas developed their own set of themes and theological concepts emanating from an interfacing of Hinduism, in particular, the Vaishnava tradition, and Ismaili Islam. As a matter of course, a number of other Indic elements, as well as traditions and mystical movements, emerged from Hinduism such as tantra, which is a tradition of beliefs and ritual practices that aims to channel the divine

realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n8/mode/1up

2017-12 -Has Kalki Already Appeared as Ali (1245)

realpatidar.com

energy of the Godhead into the human being, and bhakti, a movement based on devotion to God, especially prevalent in North India. These two groups affected the evaluation of the Ginan literature (Daftary 1998: 183-84). Besides this, the teachings of sants, a group of lower caste poet saints, who were part of a powerful anti-ritual and anti-caste movement that swept across India contemporaneously with the Satpanthi tradition, did also impact the composition of the Ginans (Syed 1936: 47; Esmail 2002: 13).

The texts containing the thoughts of dā'īs such as Satgur Nūr, Pīr Shams al-Dīn , Pīr Sadr al-Dīn and Imam Shah, whose period is called as 'great pīrs', constitute the backbone of the Ginan collections. In the course of time, the significance and status of the Ginans have gradually increased among the Nizārī Khoja community. As a result of this popularity, many Ginans were composed in a number of Indic languages and dialects of Sind, Panjab, and Gujarat (Nanji 1978: 9; Allana 1984: 44). These hymns, which vary in length from four to over a thousand verses, were transmitted orally for several centuries before being recorded primarily in the Khojki script developed in Sind by the Khoja community. Each hymn typically comes to an end with an attribution to a specific dā'ī or pīr, who was appointed by the Imam (Jairazbhoy 2004: 254). As a result of an oral tradition, it is true that some Ginans also narrate anachronistic and legendary accounts of the activities of pīrs and their converts. In this respect, not all of the Ginans are generally reliable as historical sources of information. Yet, these texts have continued to occupy a central role in the religious life and rituals of the Nizārī Khojas, since they are held to contain the teachings of their pīrs (Stans 2016: 19). Even though the authorship of the Ginan is not certain, these religious texts are in general ascribed to a few early pīrs or dā'īs in the Indian subcontinent. The composers of the Ginans are depicted as gurus who guide the disciples to the path of darshan or didar (spiritual enlightenment) and liberation. If a disciple successfully follows his/her guide's messages, hence, he or she would be blessed with the vision of the Divine Light (Daftary 1998: 177-78).

Since the late nineteenth century, Ginan manuscripts, which were found in different regions such as Kathiawad, Kutch, Sind, and Punjab, have begun to be collected and classified. In this context, Mukhi Lalji Devraj and his colleagues were officially appointed in the time of Aga

realpatidar.com

Link: http://www.realpatidar.com/library
email: mail@realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n9/mode/1up

realpatidar.com

Khan III, Sultan Muhammed Shah (d. 1957) to compile different copies and create a standard Ginan literature. This team brought hundreds of manuscripts that were acquired from different regions to the city of Bombay, where they prepared them for printing. Concluding a work of more than ten years, Khoja Sindhi Printing Press firstly published these texts in the Khocki alphabet. Such an attempt has been made so that the Ginan texts can be distributed and read among all members of the congregation. These texts were later published in other alphabets commonly used in the Indian subcontinent (Asani 2002: 44). Khojas argue that only a fraction of the texts of Ginan reached today so that the actual number of these texts cannot be exactly known. An important part of the Ginans, which seems to have disappeared due to various reasons, remains to be discovered.

It is clear that because of several reasons the different groups of Ismailis residing in India have developed various perspectives towards the Ginans. Though the Ginan literature is mostly shared by the Imamshahis in Gujarat, who are believed to have split off from the Khojas at some time during the 16th century, these texts have particularly made an important contribution to the arrangement of the religious life of Satpanth traditions. In the context of Khoja practices, Ginans come to life when they are sung. The religious meaning of these hymns is centered in their ritualized performance. Reading the Ginans with a loud voice is regarded as an important worship since it is believed that via such a method the inner meanings of Ginans reveal. It is also believed that, in this way, the deep meanings hidden in Ginan come to light and that this secret treasure provides various benefits to the person who reads it. These texts are seen as a means by which the person draws closer to God. Therefore, it is emphasized that they should be memorized and read sincerely (Asani 1991: 104). While all of the Ginan texts are important among Khojas, it is more appropriate to read some of them at certain times as well as in rituals. In this sense, some specific Ginan texts have been identified to be read in particular situations such as birth, marriage or funeral rites (Kassam 1995: 5).

The establishment of an unshakable connection between the Ginans and the devotee's heart depends on the recitation of these Ginans as a song at the time of religious practice. This direct link could be obtained not only by a stressing on memorization but also on the correct receptivity

realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n10/mode/1up

2017-12 -Has Kalki Already Appeared as Ali (1245)

realpatidar.com

or audition of the Ginans. In this context, the following verse, which is attributed to Pīr Sadr al-Dīn , quoted from a Ginan demonstrates the power of singing Ginans by which the heart of prayer attains a deep pleasure. 'Recite Ginans and the self-fills with Light! Thus will your hearts be made blissful' (Pīr Sadr ad- Dīn 61: 54-55).

As a result, the Nizārī Ismā'īliyyah has reached until today through the Ginan texts that were compiled and recorded by the religious leaders of the Khoja community. The Ginans contributed to the formation of a social identity and the development of a sense of unity among the members of the congregation. Once they gathered in a meeting, they read these texts in a collective manner. Through the Ginans, they have retained and strengthened their past ties and carried it to future generations. This functional aspect of the Ginans played a crucial role in both the transmission of the Satpanth tradition and teachings to the new generations as well as the protection of Nizārī Ismaili thoughts up until today. In-depth analyzes on the Ginan texts, therefore, will contribute to both the discovery of the development process of the Nizārī Ismaili tradition in the Indian subcontinent and the understanding of the social structure of the contemporary Ismaili community.

Indic elements in the Ginans

The pīrs, compilers of the Ginans, had transformed Hindu mythology, motifs, and concepts into narratives propounding their religious teachings. Though the pīrs condemned and banned idol worship, a variety of symbolic correspondences and equivalences were established in some Ginans between Hindu and Islamic concepts, notions, religious terminologies and figures. One of the prominent reason for such an attitude probably is expediting the orientation periods of new individuals who have recently approved Nizārī Khoja doctrines by giving up their ancient tradition that is Hinduism.

In this sense, after an in-depth analysis one will be able to disclose religious vocabularies, practices and beliefs such as svarga (heaven), dasond (paying the tithe), performing the ghatpat ceremony (installation of holy water), seva (service), sakhavat (charity), smarana or dhyana (meditation), vrata (keeping vows), dharma (moral conduct), satgur (true guide),

realpatidar.com

Link: http://www.realpatidar.com/library
email: mail@realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n11/mode/1up

realpatidar.com

kaliyuga (the last age of cosmic world), mahadin (the day of judgment), samsara or dvagamana (cycle of rebirth), moksha or avagamana (release from the cycle of rebirth), yama (divine being responsible for death), dasa avatara (the ten incarnations of god) and kalki or nakalanki (savior) in the Ginans.

It should be declared clearly that Hinduism is a religious system that has emerged as a result of the unification of different beliefs and customs in the process of a long period. Therefore, it is impossible to reveal all aspects of the influence of Indic elements in Ginan literature in a short paper. When we analyze the texts it is revealed that they mostly benefited and were influenced from beliefs and motifs of the Vaishnava sect of Hinduism because they initially appeared to address a largely Vaishnava audience. In this study, some of these elements such as the concept of bhakti and Kalki avatar have been selected and examined how and why such kinds of doctrines were transformed into Nizārī thoughts by the composers of Ginans.

The founding of religious and philosophical terms of Hinduism indicates that the prominent Hindu religious movement bhakti, which flourished in the medieval period, has more or less influenced the evolution of the Ginan literature. To comprehend such a mutual interaction between bhakti and Ginan literature, the appearance and evaluation of the bhakti tradition should be mentioned. In brief, the term bhakti was used in Hinduism in the context of a movement emphasizing the mutual intense emotional attachment and love of a devotee towards a personal god and of the god for the devotee. In general, it is accepted that the bhakti movement firstly appeared in Tamil Nadu in Southern India with the Shaiva Nayanars and the Vaishnava Alvars. The bhakti movement swept over east and north India from the fifteenth century, reaching its peak between the fifteenth and seventeenth century through some prominent bhakti leaders such as Caitanya, Nanak, Kabir and Tulsidas and their religious writings. Their religious innovation has affected not only Vaishnava Hinduism and all the rest of the Hindu society but even the worldviews of some outstanding theologians belonging to other religious traditions (Pandeya 1991: 20-24).

Though the bhakti originally emerged from Hinduism itself, its vocabularies and terms were used by pīrs to express the relationship of devotion between disciples and the Imam (Busch 2006:33; Iraqi 2009: 15-

realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n12/mode/1up

2017-12 -Has Kalki Already Appeared as Ali (1245)

realpatidar.com

17). For instance in the Ginans the concept of virahini, one of the most powerful representative of devotion in bhakti poetry, best exemplified by Radha (a Hindu goddess mostly depicted alongside Krishna and accepted as the most important gopi) and the gopis (a group of cow herding girls) in their longing for Krishna, becomes symbolic of the human soul who experiences viraha (painful longing) for the beloved, almost always identified as the Imam. Many Ginans, hence, portray the believer as a virahini (Asani 2002: 64-70). In this sense, the reality that a member of the community should devote himself/herself sincerely is often portrayed in the Ginan texts in the form of an Imam. Therefore, such concepts borrowed from bhakti thought are remodified to emphasize the obedience between the individual and the Imam. In this way, the Imam is presented not only as a guide that leads the individual to the divine truth but also as a spiritual being that one must be devoted to with love even if he is physically and geographically distant.

Another important term used in Ginan literature is vaikuntha, which has a significant value in the Vaishnava tradition. They believe that those who reach the celestial abode of Vishnu, vaikuntha, have a perfect mood and are deprived of all kinds of bad feelings and thoughts such as desire, will, and ambition. The following verses demonstrate that the Ginans sometimes prefer the term of vaikuntha while talking about the hereafter. 'Without pīr, there is no heaven (vaikuntha). Know this well, my brother.' 'Those who recognize the Satpnath and follow the words of the pīr, can only get rid of the rebirth circle and attain the paradise (vaikuntha)' (Pīr Shams ad-Dīn , 43:7; 71:1). The use of these kinds of concepts in the Ginan texts reveals that the composers were influenced by local elements and that the majority of those who accepted the Satpanth tradition were Hindu by origin (Kassam 1995: 71).

Nizārī Khojas, while explaining their views on the Qur'an, have benefited from Hindu terms related to the concept of a holy book. In the Ginans, the Qur'an is interpreted as a divine book and is compared with Vedas, the basic sacred text of Hindus. The Vedas have been separated into four basic texts, namely Rigveda, Yajurveda, Samaveda and Atharvaveda according to their content and evolution. In Hindu religious tradition, it is accepted that each Veda contains the basic beliefs of the previous text (Kutluturk 2014: 44-45). From this point of view, they have pointed out that the Qur'an contains the basic teachings of the three previous Holy

realpatidar.com

Link: http://www.realpatidar.com/library
email: mail@realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n13/mode/1up

realpatidar.com

Scriptures; namely Torah, Psalm and Bible, and thus have they compared the Qur'an with Atharvaveda, the last book of Vedas. Dā'īs have stated that when Hindus examine their religious text carefully, they will be able to perceive the connection between the Vedas and the Qur'an (Pīr Shams ad-Dīn , 202:1). It is also understood that the Khojas have tried to establish a connection between the Qur'an and the Vedic texts by the influence of their social environment and cultural features whose roots are very ancient.

Has Kalki already manifested as 'Alī? A syncretic approach

The most explicit and effective impact of the Indic element on the Ginan literature is the doctrine of avatara (incarnation of God) peculiarly developed in the Vaishnava tradition in medieval India, which directly relates with the concept of Messiah or awaited savior in Hinduism as well as Nizārī Ismā'īliyyah. A brief description of the doctrines of Imamah in Nizārī Ismaliyyah and avatara in Hinduism is required to make a clear comparison between each religious tradition.

One of the most important principles of faith in Nizārī Ismā'īliyyah is believing in the existence of a masum (innocent) Imam, who is the descendent of 'Alī. Since the essence of this sect is the submission to such an Imam, all adherents have to respect and follow his orders. They believe that Imams are real guides and exemplary personalities; therefore, can the truth only be obtained by obeying them (Öz 1993: 615).

In Hinduism, the doctrine of avatara (incarnation of God) indicates Vishnu's descending on earth for the protection of the good and for the destruction of evil, and for the re-establishment of cosmic order. In the Bhagavadgita, God explains the basic reason for his incarnations as 'Whenever dharma (righteousness) wanes and adharma (falsehood) increases I send myself forth' (Bhagavadgita 4.7). In spite of the fact that the number and names of avatars vary from one Hindu writing to another, ten avataras of Vishnu are the most popular in the Hindu tradition. This standard list of ten avataras includes the Fish, the Tortoise, the Boar, the Man-Lion, the Dwarf, Parasurama, Rama, Krishna, the Buddha and Kalki (Garuda Purana, 1.86.10-11). At the end of the world, in which righteousness will wane and corruption will increase, according

realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n14/mode/1up

2017-12 -Has Kalki Already Appeared as Ali (1245)

realpatidar.com

to avatara doctrine, Vishnu will come again as a Kalki avatara for saving pious individuals and reviving Hindu beliefs. The missions of avatara are what enabled the Hindu religion to survive for centuries by providing the avatara doctrine as a significant belief in the eyes of Hindus (Kutluturk 2017: 73).

Both chronicles and vernacular sources demonstrate that the belief in the incarnation of any deity or idea of the forthcoming of a messiah has affected many religious movements and sects that separated in the Indian subcontinent. This kind of an interaction, for instance, may be clearly seen in the Khoja tradition. Such that the concept of dasa avatara, which had a standard list in the historical process and was mentioned in various ancient Hindu religious texts such as Mahabharata, Ramayana, Harivamsa and Bhagavad Purana, was largely transported to the Khoja tradition in terms of utilizing the same denotation, Dasa Avatara. Hence, Dasa Avatara became one of the most significant parts of Ginan literature which was regularly recited in Khojas' prayer assemblies throughout the region. The doctrine of the incarnation of God as a savior of the true religion and all of its devoted members can explicitly be found in an important Ginan entitled Dasa Avatara that has been recorded in three separate versions attributed to Pīr Shams al-Dīn , Pīr Sadr al-Dīn and Imam Shah (Khakee 1972: 11-12). This Ginan with strong Hindu influences presents the Imam as the long-awaited savior within a Vaishnava framework concerning the dasa avatara of the Hindu deity Vishnu through the yugas (ages). Dasa Avatara, often hailed as a Khoja classic, created an ostensible equivalence between the Hindu concept of avatara and the Ismaili concept of Imam (Khakee 1972: 305).

The narration of Krishna avatara in the Dasa Avatara literature is another important indication in the sense of the influence of Indic elements on the Ginan literature. The early Sanskrit writings such as Harivamsa (55-56), Vishnu Purana (2.7) and Bhagavad Purana (10.16) all speak about the myth of Krishna avatara within the framework of his biography. Though there are some small differences between them, they all describe how Krishna jumps from a tree into the basin of Yamuna and how after fooling the spectators with the apparent weakness, he starts fighting the Nag and overpowering him and so on. Pīr Sadr al-Dīn 's Dasa Avatara also includes the same tale (Devraj 1921: 9-10; Mallison 2010: 120). The last lines of the Dasa Avatara are followed by a few prose sentences

realpatidar.com

Link: http://www.realpatidar.com/library
email: mail@realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n15/mode/1up

realpatidar.com

detailing the names of Krishna's parents. The next verses handle almost exclusively Krishna's numerous heroic exploits to rescue the Baj country from its evils or demons, which is known as the nagadamana story. 'After listening to these words, the wrestler fulfilled since the Lord (Krishna) strangled his body, with his hands. Krishna put an end to king Kams's lineage by destroying the aforementioned ruler' (Dasa Avatara Nano 17-19). Hence in the Dasa Avatara, as in Sanskrit and vernacular stories, the nagadamana episode is mentioned as part of the exploits of Krishna, the eighth avatara of god Vishnu.

Dasa Avatara is composed of ten parts, the last section of the work, particularly, was greatly esteemed by the Khojas and recited during pre-burial rites for the deceased. While the first nine incarnations mostly remained unchanged in the earlier section of this Ginan, the last one changed in its final part and here the first Shi'a Imam, 'Alī, was identified as the awaited tenth avatar as such:

'God in his tenth manifestation, assumed a form and became visible. The Supreme first manifested in the form of a fish (Matsya); He was the support for the seer Mugdala. In his form as a tortoise (Kurma), he churned the ocean; the fourteen jewels were thus recovered. He became visible to the aid of King Ambarisa; Thus the King reached the other shore. In the form of the boar (Varaha), he seized the universe; He clenched the whole of it with his great teeth. God (Narayana) then descended as the lion (Narasimha); Prahlad fell prostrate and begged at his feet. When he came the form of the dwarf (Vamana), he spoke; He delivered Kamala, the fortunate. He grabbed Kamala's husband in his hand. Then he manifested in the form of Rama, he killed Ravana; He took a hold of Hariscandra's hand. He saved Hariscandra's son as well as his wife. Then, he became visible as Krishna! He preserved Draupadi with reams of cloth. In this fourth age (kaliyuga), he has become manifest; He is 'Alī, mighty comrade of Muhammad. Whoever worships and respects him determinedly, that man or woman will be rescued.' (Pīr Shams ad-Dīn , 28:52-64; 32:10).

In other words, the messianic tenth incarnation of Vishnu that is Kalki was renamed in the Khoja tradition as Nakalanki, 'the stainless one', and identified with the first Shiite Imam, 'Alī. The following verses quoted from various Ginans set forth such an identification. 'The avatar of this fourth age is Nakalanki; know that he is a Muslim; He

realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n16/mode/1up

2017-12 -Has Kalki Already Appeared as Ali (1245)

realpatidar.com

who was wrathful with the infidels, indeed, he has come. He has taken form (avatar) as the man Islam Shah; know that he is the Satgur! Pīr Shams says: O pious ones listen to this wisdom (ginan).' (Pīr Shams ad-Dīn , 17.5). 'The tenth is the Shah! He has kindled the Light (jyota) and made the Invisible (alakha) manifest.' (Pīr Shams ad-Dīn , 27.5). On the other hand the expression of 'Alī's emergence on a vehicle of which title is given as 'Duldul' (Pīr Shams ad-Dīn , 4:1-3), recalls some expressions about the Kalki avatara, an expected savior in Hindu scriptures (Agni Purana, 16.10).

According to Fyzee (1965: 504), Dasa Avatara is precisely a book composed or adapted by dā'īs of the Nizārī Ismailis to convert Hindus, who were not very learned in their religious faith. Such a book presumed the nine incarnations of Vishnu to be true as far as they go, but not the whole truth, and then supplied the imperfect Vaishnava system by adding the basic doctrine of the Nizārī Ismailis, the incarnation and coming manifestation of the 'Most Holly' 'Alī. As a result, it is understood that the doctrine of the messiah in Hindu tradition was redesigned in the Ginans in accordance with the idea of Imamah. In this context, it is seen that the name of Kalki was changed to Nakalanki meaning 'innocent, pure, spotless and without sin' and is associated with 'Alī, the first Imam of the Shi'a.

In Hindu sacred texts, the concept of avatara is often used to mean that God himself descends on the earth and embodies different forms of existence. The question of whether the doctrine of avatara in the texts of Ginan is identical to the meaning expressed in the Hindu religious tradition has been the subject of debate since such a doctrine does not accord with Islamic thought. In general, the avatara doctrine found in the Ginans has been interpreted as a manifestation of the divine being rather than an incarnation of God (Esmail: 2002:27). Most Khoja adherents interpreted this concept in the sense that God's divine light spread to 'Alī and other Imams as well as pīrs. In the Nizārī Khoja community, Imams have been considered spiritual leaders bearing the light of 'Alī. It is believed that the dā'īs who are in charge of spreading the dawa are procurator of Imams. In accordance with this idea, Imams, as well as dā'īs, have been sometimes presented as avataras in the Ginan texts (Pīr Shams ad-Dīn , 17:6). In this way they are presented as holy men possessing divine attributes. It is clear that the composers of Ginan literature have

realpatidar.com

Link: http://www.realpatidar.com/library
email: mail@realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n17/mode/1up

2017-12 -Has Kalki Already Appeared as Ali (1245)

realpatidar.com

benefited from local Hindu motifs, terminologies and concepts, which are largely famous among Indian people. They have customized such kinds of elements according to their Shiite background. In other words, they re-apply an older method known as mesel-memsul (sample-sampled) in Ismaili tradition in order to expand their sectarian ideas. Thereby they have obtained a good opportunity to clarify Ismaili thoughts, which were not common among local people, by using some specific samples that were familiar to them.

The attitude of purging of Indic elements

From the beginning of the nineteenth century, Indic elements found in the Ginan texts lead to increasing disputes about the religious and social identity of Khojas who were faced with diverse Hindu, Sunni and Shi'a rites and customs. The historical sources point out that a series of measures such as the eliminating of Hindu customs and removing of Indic elements from Ginans have been taken by leaders of Nizārī Khojas to end such kinds of tensions, which were raised within the Khoja community itself. The attempts to eradicate both Indic terminologies as well as Hindu religious thoughts from the Ginan literature, which have especially occurred in the last two centuries, will be briefly cited here in order to touch upon the impact of Vaishnava terms and doctrines on the texts that have been continued until the last centuries.

The religious and social developments that have occurred among Khojas should be considered to enable a true analysis of the procedure of erasing Indic elements from the Ginan literature. According to historical data, the debates in the Khoja community flared up further after the arriving of the Agha Khan I (1808-1881), Imam Ḥasan ʿAlī Shah, to India in 1848. He took some precautions to solve the existing problems such as the payment of tithes, the management of the community, and the use of common property. First and foremost, he emphasized on the Shiite identity of the Khojas by the purging of certain Hindu and Sunni influences such as observance of the law of inheritance, and burial and marriage customs from their life (Shodhan 2010: 173-174).

After him, to crystallize the ideality of the Ismaili Khojas one of the most important efforts has been exhibited by Aga Khan III (1877-1957),

realpatidar.com

Link: http://www.realpatidar.com/library
email: mail@realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n18/mode/1up

2017-12 -Has Kalki Already Appeared as Ali (1245)

realpatidar.com

also known as Sultan Muhammad Shah, who primarily focused on the religious texts of the community. By using his authority over the society, he carried out a series of reforms regarding the Khoja community directly to reveal their true religious identity. In this regard, he officially charged some eminent scholars to produce a printed canon of the Ginans in the early twentieth century (Bruce 2016: 15). As Shodhan clearly mentioned (2010: 175), approving of these kinds of Ginans were not as means of conversion but as a declaration of the Nizārī Khojas being different from Muslims and Hindus.

In this period of approving or rejecting of Ginan literature, some manuscripts were not only destroyed or buried but the words and terms that recall the Hindu doctrines were widely altered. As stated by Akhtar (2013: 50), 'These changes can be seen in the Khoja Ismailis especially in the elimination of their Hindu philosophies, which were carried out by the respective religious leadership of the various Khoja religious communities. The vernacular dua expressions were replaced by Arabic, hierarchical forms of religious authority were created and institutionalized and orthodox belief replaced vernacular expressions of faith.'

In the following years, some parts of the Ginans, which included a large content of Hindu beliefs, were either dropped or changed. For instance, in Karachi, in 1956, the Ginanic verses that mention about 'Alī as the avataras of matsya, kurma, Rama, etc., were replaced with the names of prophets; namely as Adam, Noah, Ibrahim, Isa, etc (Rattansi 1987: 79). However, one of the most important decision to purge traces of Indic elements of Ginan literature has been implied by Karim Aga Khan IV in a conference that was held in Paris. Those who shared similar ideas asserted that to achieve a uniform and a standard religious education syllabus among community members some basic alterations or modifications were needed to be performed (Rattansi 1987: 157).

From this point of view, it was determined that the Ginans should be classified into three categories according to their wording and content. The first one is; the Ginans which do not contain any Indic elements. The texts that were included in this category such as Bujh Nirijan, Sioko Mote were deemed authentic and continued to be read in religious ceremonies. The second one is; the Ginans including few Hindu words or terms. It was recognized that if this kind of notions were changed with

realpatidar.com

Link: http://www.realpatidar.com/library
email: mail@realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n19/mode/1up

realpatidar.com

new ones, such as the replacement of Hari with ʿAlī, such an intervention would not influence their content as well as structure. Indeed, during the conference, it was decided to replace Hindu terms found in some specific Ginans with their Islamic equivalents. Particularly, those Indic elements that recast to incorporate Shi'a beliefs or to exalt the status of ʿAlī. In this way, Hari was replaced by ''Alī', Swam by 'Maula', Gur Brahma by 'Nabi Muhammad', Gur by 'Pīr' and so on (Asani 1992: 108-109; Khan 2010: 106). The following verse attributed to Pīr Ḥasan Kabir al-Dīn , can be given here as an example, which includes the term of ʿAlī/Hari. 'Full of hope, I stand at your door, O ʿAlī! Joining my hands, This I ask of you: Let me have sight of you. O, great savior! At your feet, I lay myself…' (Pīr Ḥasan Kabir al- Dīn , 43:8; Esmail 2002: 185).

The Ginans comprising excessive Hindu ideas and doctrines were classified as a third category. Using such texts, which were regarded as 'including excessive Hindu elements', were simply forbidden. For instance the recitation of the Dasa Avatara, one of the classic Ginans of Khoja literature that considers ʿAlī as the last, long-awaited manifestation of Vishnu, were to be banned from being recited in jamaat khanas, praying rooms. Such kinds of Ginans were perceived as a potential threat to their identity; therefore, they gradually disappeared from the general consciousness of the community. In the late 1970s, other compositions that clarified Ismaili doctrine especially within an Indic framework had lost their value among the Khoja community (Rattansi1987: 157).

The prominent supporters of this modification attempt, particularly the officials of the Ismailia Association, clarify their ideas by arguing these arguments. 'For basic religious education, it is necessary for young children to have (Ginans) in an Islamic Form ... It is indeed our great fortune that as a result of minor modifications, we are able to make the most use of the Ginans, which is our wonderful and unique heritage, otherwise, as we know, the writings of many our past writers have had to be completely set aside and shelved.' (Rattansi 1987: 160).

It needs to be stated that the changes in the Ginan literature were not widely supported or accepted by Nizārī Khojas. Some of them claim that no attempts should be done to change the wording of Ginans. According to them, such alterations would not only diminish the authority of the Imam and damage the spiritual aspect of Ginans but also cover the real meaning of the verses. Such an intervention, on the other hand, harm the

realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n20/mode/1up

2017-12 -Has Kalki Already Appeared as Ali (1245)

realpatidar.com

Ginans' poetical and religious value. Since the Ginans are believed to be divinely inspired, they should not be reconciled by purging or banning its local elements. On the other hand, the eminent leaders of the Khoja community generally try to convince their adherents about this issue and explain why they need to clear their religious texts from Hindu elements. In this regard, they claim that the pīrs had been kind enough to make things easy for their ancestors by permitting them to pursue their Hindu customs in the beginning. However, these customs or practices were now no longer necessary, hence the Khojas could return to the original version of their credo (Papanek, 1962: 78).

Along with this eradicating of the literary works and as a result of the contact of Ismali Khojas with Ismaili communities in other parts of the world, the Ginans have won a new meaning and dimension in the sight of some Ismaili Khoja followers. In this context, some of the followers have re-interpreted the literature and suggest that Ginans are only one part of the global literary traditions of Ismaili devotional literature. Therefore, though the importance of the Ginans as sources of a normative understanding of Khoja faith and practice gradually diminished, in the last centuries depending on various developments, it is known that considerable numbers of Ismaili Khojas kept reciting these texts (Rattansi 1987: 157).

Consequently, it is impossible to know exactly when the Ginans were attributed to Ismaili pīrs nor to what extent the oral transmission modified the content through the centuries. It is certain, however, that these religious texts, in particular, specific parts including Indic elements, were revised in the nineteenth and twentieth century. Even though defenders of this new method put forward some reasons, like to create a standard corpus of the Ginans and to disclose their religious identity, on their recent regulation on the Ginan literature, such an attempt itself approves that in the process of historical interaction in medieval period in India composers of scriptures of Khoja community have been influenced and benefited from their Indian environment. As a consequent of this inevitable mutual interaction, many Indic elements seeped into the Ginan literature depending upon various socio-cultural and religious-historical grounds.

realpatidar.com

Link: http://www.realpatidar.com/library
email: mail@realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n21/mode/1up

realpatidar.com

Conclusion

A major branch of the Shiʿa, the Ismāʿīliyyah reached the Indian subcontinent via religious teachers, dāʿīs, who were actively propagating the Ismaili faith in areas like Sindh, Gujarat, and Punjab from the tenth to the fifteenth century. They were instructed to become masters of the local language and to learn as much as possible about the cultural and religious avenue in which they resided. As a part of the process of dawa, they composed a number of religious hymns, Ginans, as a method to disseminate their religious thought. The hymns composed by these figures incorporated many Hindu themes and beliefs, in particular, the Vaishnava doctrine of avatara. These texts, furthermore, drew symbols directly from other religious systems such as using Hindu deities to describe the Imam and expressing their pīrs as yogis, gurus or sadhus.

For centuries, scholars examining the Khoja tradition have tried to construe the basic reasons for such an interaction or resemblance between each tradition and have tried to put forward some solutions. One of them is that the pīrs operating in South Asia used Hindu symbols as a means to express their religious ideas in a framework that would be familiar to potential converts and early initiates (Nanji 1978: 106). On the other hand, while some scholars, like ʿAlī Asani (2002: 5), refer to this process as one in which pīrs presented Ismaili ideas in an acculturated form that drew on symbolism from Indic culture, others argue that using of terms from other religious discourses by pīrs should be understood as metaphorically. According to them, Nizārī Khojas utilized metaphors as a means for acquiring esoteric knowledge and a method for explaining their religious practice. Against this view, it has been asserted that Khojas really believed that the Imam was the tenth incarnation of Vishnu and their aim was not to apply metaphors. According to proponents of this view, Khojas used Indic elements as well as beliefs in their literature to represent their tradition in a syncretic mold. However, the question of whether the Khojas faith is a syncretic blend of Hindu and Nizārī Ismaili traditions has also been disputed among theologians (Bashkow 2004: 445; Strohl 2011: 122).

Both ideological and theological resemblance between the Khoja

realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n22/mode/1up

2017-12 -Has Kalki Already Appeared as Ali (1245)

realpatidar.com

community and the Hindu tradition have at times been explained through the idea of taqiyya (dissimulation), one of the primary unique attributes and methods of almost all Shi'a sects. Dissimulation meant something much more than the masking of the true identity and personality or superficial embrace of an exterior shape. In this sense, Satpanth was regarded as a complex form of dissimulation adapted to the religious, social, cultural and political issues of their dispersed area. In this context, as Tazim argued (1997: 37), implementation of taqiyya is not easy since the fulfillment of such a method involves a complex process of adhesion and syncretism. That is why the Nizārī Khojas of the subcontinent differ significantly from the other Nizārī Ismaili groups that developed in Central Asia, Persia and Syria.

The most reasonable explanation about this process, which is also favored by us, is that the pīrs probably asked to gain support among the non-Muslims by constituting the impression that their beliefs were similar to local Hindu beliefs. On this subject, Zahid, one of the most outstanding scholars on Nizārī Ismailism, put forward significant details along with logical solutions and implications. According to him (1975: 49) the Nizārī dawa comprehended the difficulty of recovering the lost following of Fatimid Ismailis in the face of internal debates, hostile orthodox Turkish hukumdars (rulers) along with well-educated sufi messengers. Therefore, they decided to obtain new supporters and followers among the non-Muslims, especially in India, by demonstrating that their beliefs were familiar to local Hindu beliefs. It is clear that Hindu doctrines and symbols are deliberately used in their compositions, Ginans, to convey a message of faith. It may be claimed that the motifs and doctrines drawn from the Hindu epic literature such as Ramayana and Mahabharata could have been used as a means to store and thereby preserve in memory, actual events, and incidents that occurred in the early dawa in the Indian Subcontinent.

The Ginan tradition as a whole possesses a remarkable internal consistency and wholeness, even though this tradition is penetrated with Indic concepts, myths, sentiments, and motifs found within the Indian background. Therefore this scene indicates that the composers of this literature were not precipitately adopting Indic practices and doctrines. On the contrary, it is frankly understood that the resulting syncretism of their work, is not an inattentive attempt, but a carefully and successively

realpatidar.com

Link: http://www.realpatidar.com/library
email: mail@realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n23/mode/1up

realpatidar.com

crafted alliance of ideas.

References

Akhtar, Iqbal (2013). *The Oriental African: The Evolution of Postcolonial Islamic Identities among the Globalized Khōjā of Dar es Salaam*. PhD thesis, University of Edinburgh.

_____. (2015). *The Khōjā of Tanzania Discontinuities of a Postcolonial Religious Identity*, Brill: Leiden.

al-Ashari, Abul-Ḥasan A. (1950). *Makalatul-Islamiyyin wa Iḫtilaful-Musallin*, ed. Muḥammad Muḥyiddin Abdulḥamid, Kahira: Maktabatu'n-Nahḍati'l-Mıṣriyya.

Allana, Gulam (1984). *Ginans of Ismaili Pirs Rendered into English Verse*, Karachi: Ismailia Association for Pakistan.

Asani, Ali S. (1991). 'The Ginan Literature of the Isma'ilis of Indo-Pakistan: Its Origins, Characteristics, and Themes', *In Devotion Divine: Bhakti Traditions from the Regions of India*, ed. Diana L. Eck and Francoise Mallison, Groeningen: Egbert Forsten, and Paris: Ecole Francaise d'Extreme-Orient.

_____. (1992). *'The Ismaili Ginans as Devotional Literature', in Devotional Literature in South Asia*, ed. R. S. McGregor, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

_____. (1996). *'The Isma'ili Ginans: Reflections on Authority and Authorship', in Medieval Isma'ili History and Thought*, ed. Farhad Daftary, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

_____. (2002). Ecstasy and Enlightenment: *The Ismaili Devotional Literature of South Asia*, London: IB Taurus.

Avcu, Ali (2009). 'Fatimî-Karmatî İlişkisine Dair Bazı Mülahazalar', in *Cumhuriyet Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* XIII, no. 2, 243-265.

_____. (2016). 'Bâtınî Ekolleri Anlamada Anahtar Bir Kavram: Ezılle/Gölgeler Nazariyesi', in *Cumhuriyet İlahiyat Dergisi* XX, no. 2, 101-135.

Bashkow, Ira (2004). 'A Neo-Boasian Conception of Cultural Boundaries', in *American Anthropologist* CVI, no. 3, 443-458.

Boivin, Michel (2010). 'Ginans and the Management of the Religious Heritage of the Ismaili Khojas in Sindh', in *Ginans Texts and Contexts*, ed. Tazim R. Kassam and Francoise Mallison, Delhi: Primus Books.

Bruce, Juan (2016). 'Typographic development of the Khojki script and printing affairs at the turn of the 19th century in Bombay', in *Khōjā Studies Conference*, Paris.

Busch, Allison (2006). 'Questioning the Tropes about 'Bhakti' and 'Riti' in Hindi Literary Historiograph', in *Bhakti in Current Research,* ed. Monika Horstmann, Delhi: Manohar.

realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n24/mode/1up

2017-12 -Has Kalki Already Appeared as Ali (1245)

realpatidar.com

Daftary, Farhad (1998). A Short History of the Ismailis: Traditions of a Muslim Community. *Islamic Surveys*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Davis, J. R. (2007). *The Shi'a Imami Ismaili Muslims: A Short Introduction*, Morrisville: Lulu.com.

Devraj, Lalbhai. (ed.) (1921). *Dasa avatara nano* (racanara Pira Sadaradina), Mumbai.

Engineer, Ashgar Ali (1988). 'A Special Issue on: Bohras, Khojas, and Memons' in *Islamic Perspective*: A Biannual Journal I, Bombay: Institute of Islamic Studies.

Esmail, Aziz (2002). *A Scent of Sandalwood: Indo-Ismaili Religious Lyrics* (Ginans), Richmond and London: Curzon Press.

Faridi, K. Lutfullah (1899). *Gazetteer of the Bombay Presidency. Bombay: Government* Central Press.

Fyzee, Asaf Ali Asghar (1965). *Cases in the Muhammadan Law of India and Pakistan,* London: Oxford Clarendon Press.

Ghosh, Pika (2005). 'Narrating Krisna's Biography: Temple Imagery, Oral Performance, and Vaisnava Mission in Seventeenth-Century Bengal', in *Artibus Asiae* LXV, no. 1, 78-83.

Ginan-e Sharif: Our Wonderful Tradition, Vancouver: Ismailia Association for Canada, n.d.

Hickling, Carissa (1998). *Disinheriting Daughters: Applying Hindu Laws of Inheritance to the Khoja Muslim Cornrnunity in Western India, 1847- 1937*. MA thesis, University of Manitoba.

Ibn Manzur, Abu'l-Fadl Muhammad b. M. (n.d.). *Lisanu'l-Arab*, ed. Abdullah Ali al-Kabir, Kahira: Daru'l-Maarif.

Iraqi, Shahabuddin (2009). *Bhakti Movement in Medieval India: Social and Political Perspective*, Delhi: Monahar Publishers.

Ivanow, W. (1936). 'The Sect of Imam Shah in Gujarat', *Journal of the Bombay Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society* XII, 19-70.

_____. (1948). 'Satpanth (Indian Ismailism)', in *Collectanea*, edit. W. Ivanow, Leiden: Brill, 1-54.

Jairazbhoy, A. (2004). 'Sacred Songs of Khoja Muslims: Sounded and Embodied Liturgy and Devotion', in *Ethnomusicology* XXXXVIII, no. 2, 251-270.

Jani, Balvant S. (2010). 'Ginān̄s Attributed to Unknown Composers', in *Ginans Texts and Contexts*, ed. Tazim R. Kassam and Francoise Mallison, Delhi: Primus Books.

Kassam, Tazim R. (1995). *Songs of Wisdom and Circles of Dance: Hymns of the Satpanth Ismaili Muslim Saint, Pir Shams*, Albany: State University of New York Press.

Khakee, Gulshan (1972). '*The Dasa Avatara of the Satpanthi Ismailis and Imam Shahis of*

realpatidar.com

Link: http://www.realpatidar.com/library
email: mail@realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n25/mode/1up

realpatidar.com

Indo-Pakistan', PhD diss., Harvard University.

Khan, Ansar Zahid (1975). 'Isma'ilism in Multan and Sind', in *Journal Pakistan Historical Society* XXIII, no. 1, 36-57.

Khan, Sila-Dominique (1997). 'The Coming of Nikalank Avatar: A Messianic Theme in Some Sectarian Traditions of North-Western India', in *Journal of Indian Philosophy* XXV, 401–426.

_____. (2010). 'Rewriting the Ginans: Revolution and Resistance among the Imamshahis', in *Ginans Texts and Contexts*, ed. Tazim R. Kassam and Francoise Mallison, Delhi: Primus Books.

Kummi-Navbahti (2004). *Şii Fırkalar, trans. H. Onat, S. Hizmetli, S. Kutlu and R. Şimşek*, Ankara: Ankara Okulu Yayınları.

Kutluturk, Cemil (2014). *Hindu Kutsal Metinleri-Upanişadlar* (Hindu Sacred Texts-Upanishads), Istanbul: Dergay Yayınları.

_____. (2017). *Hinduizmde Avatar İnancı* (Concept of Avatara in Hinduism), Ankara: Otto Yayınları.

_____. (2016), '*Tasavvuf Alanında Yazılmış İlk Hintçe Eserlerde Hindu İnanç ve Kültürüne Ait İzler: Mirigavati Örneği* (The Impact of Indic Elements on the Indo-Sufi Literature: A Case Study of Qutuban Suhrawardi's Mirigawati)', in Prof. Dr. A. Küçük'e Armağan, ed. A. Hikmet Eroğlu, Ankara: Berikan Yayınları.

Mahan Ismaili Santa Pir Shams Racit Ginanono Sahgraha (Collection of Ginans Composed by the Great Ismaili Saint Pir Shams), (1952). Bombay: Ismailia Association for India.

Mahan Ismaili Santa Pir Sadardin Racit Ginanono Sangraha (Collection of Ginans Composed by the Great Ismaili Saint Pir Sadr ad-Din), (1969). Bombay: Ismailia Association for India.

Mallison, Francoise (2010). 'The Myth of Nagadamana in the Dasa-avataras and Other Ginans', in *Ginans Texts and Contexts*, ed. Tazim R. Kassam and Francoise Mallison, Delhi: Primus Books.

al-Makdisi, Shamsuddin A. (1906). *Ahsanu't-Tekasim fi Marifati'l-Akalim*, Ed. M. J. De Goeje, Leiden: Brill.

Mujtaba Ali, Syed. (1936). *The Origins of the Khojahs and their Religious Life Today,* Bonn: Ludwig Rohrscheid.

Najam al-Ghani, M. (1924) *Mazzahibu'l-Islam.* Lakhnow: Nawu'l-Kishore Matba.

Nanji, Azim (1978). *The Nizārī Ismaili Tradition of the Indo-Pak Subcontinent*, New York: Caravan Books.

an-Navbaḫti, al-Hasan b. Musa and al-Kummi, Sad b. Abdillah (1992). *Kitabu Firaki al-*

realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n26/mode/1up

2017-12 -Has Kalki Already Appeared as Ali (1245)

realpatidar.com

Shi'a, ed. Abdulmunim al-Hifni, Kahira: Daru'r-Rashad.

Öz, Mustafa (1993). 'İsmâiliyye Mezhebi', in *Milletlerarası Tarihte ve Günümüzde Şiilik Sempozyumu* (Proceedings Book), İstanbul: İlmi Neşriyat.

Pandeya, A. Govindacandra (1991). *Bhakti Darşanavimarşah*, Varanasi.

Papanek, Hanna (1962). *Leadership and Social Change in the Khoja Ismaili Community.* PhD thesis, Boston: Harvard University.

Rattansi, Diamond (1987). *Islamization and the Khojah Isma'ili Community in Pakistan.* PhD thesis, Montreal: McGill University.

al-Shahristani, Abul-Fath M. (1992). *al-Milal wan-Nihal*, ed. Aḥmad Fahmi Muḥammad, Bayrut: Daru'l-Kutubi'l- Ilmiyya.

Shodhan, Amrita (2010), 'T*he Entanglement of the Ginans in Khoja Governance', in Ginans Texts and Contexts*, ed. Tazim R. Kassam and Francoise Mallison, Delhi: Primus Books.

Stans, S. I. (2016). *Khojas of Hyderabad, an Insight in Contemporary Niẓārī Isma'ili Interreligious Realities.* MA thesis, University of Utrecht.

Strohl, David (2011). *A Respect for Difference: The Shi'a Ismaili Khojas of Mumbai*. PhD thesis, University of Virginia.

Tan, Muzaffer (2005). *İsmailiyye'nin Teşekkül Süreci*. PhD thesis, Ankara: Ankara University.

_____. (2012). 'Tarihsel Süreçte İsmaililik ve Yaşadığı Farklılaşmalar', in *Fırat Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* XVII, no. 2, 111-145.

Titus, Murray T. (1979). *Indian Islam*, New Delhi: Oriental Reprint.

Williams, M. Monier (2008). *A Sanskrit-English Dictionary*, Varanasi: Indica Books.

Notes

[1] This paper is a revised and partly modified version of 'Hindistan'daki İsmaili Hocalarda Hint Kültürü Etkisi…', first published in Journal of Ankara University Faculty of Theology, Ankara, 2017. In the process of acquiring of its present form this article has benefited from various comments and reviews that have come from different quarters. Firstly, I am most grateful to Professors; D. N. Twari, head of department of Indian Philosophy and Religion at Banaras Hindu University, India; Sheldon Pollock and particularly Allison Busch, scholars at Columbia University, USA, for their generous hosting and guidance. I would also like to thank H. Hähnert and Masooma Akhter, PhD candidates at Ankara University, for their warmly assistance in editing.

[2] For more information on the early period of Ismā'īliyyah see Kitabu Firaki al-Shi'a

realpatidar.com

Link: http://www.realpatidar.com/library
email: mail@realpatidar.com

https://archive.org/details/bk1245/page/n27/mode/1up

realpatidar.com

(an-Navbaḫti and al-Ḳummi 1992); al-Milal wan-Nihal (al-Shahristani 1992; 163-176); Makalatul-Islamiyyin wa Ihtilaful-Musallin (al-Ashari 1950: 90-98); Şii Fırkalar, (Onat and others 2004); 'İsmailiyye'nin Teşekkül Süreci' (Tan 2005: 23-114); 'Fatimî-Karmatî İlişkisine Dair Bazı Mülahazalar', (Avcu 2009: 244-265).

[3] Since 'Bohra' is an umbrella term used to describe every person dealing with trade in the Gujarat region, it should be noted that not everyone who is called Bohra is a member of the Mustʿali sect. Bohras were split into two groups on the death of their religious leader Davud b. Ajeb Shah by the end of the sixteenth century, while Bohras who settled in Yemen known as Sulaymani Bohras, the others who located in India known as Dawoodi Bohras (Najam al Ghani 1924: 312).

[4] The arriving date of Pīr Shams ad-Din to India is also not certain. Regarding with this issue there is no conformity between historical sources and traditional narratives.

[5] The belief in Imam-e Zamaan or Imam-e Asr is one of the main pillars of Ismāʿīliyyah. This composes of accepting the Master of the time/age, obeying to him and following his firmans (Davis 2007: 16).

[6] Firstly, the name of the author to whom related Ginan is attributed is given then the located and line numbers of that Ginan are cited respectively. Besides, in this study the following sources are basically used and considered. Mahan Ismaili Santa Pīr Shams Racit Ginanono Sangraha (An Anthology of Ginans composed by the Great Ismaili Saint Pīr Shams) (1952), Mahan Ismaili Santa Pīr Sadardin Racit Ginanono Sangraha (An Anthology of Ginans composed by the Great Ismaili Saint Pīr Sadr ad-Din) (1969) and English translations of them which were made by scholars such as Tazim (1995), Esmail (2002), Jani (2010) and Allana (1984).

[7] For detailed information on the current situation of Nizair Khoja see 'A Special Issue on: Bohras, Khojas, and Memons' (Engineer 1988: 215-248), which deals with the Khojas' demographic structures, educational attainments, economic conditions, and religious practices etc.

[8] Such a religious practice really resembles a Hindu practice, kirtan, which is a genre of religious performance arts that particularly improved in the bhakti tradition (Ghosh, 2005: 78-9).

[9] The term of viraha was not only used in Shi'a tradition but found in Sufi literatures which were composed by Sufis who belong to sunni silsila, to convey their both Islamic and sectarian messages to Hindus. For more information on the influences of Hindu concepts on Indo-Sufi literatures see 'Tasavvuf Alanında Yazılmış İlk Hintçe Eserlerde Hindu İnanç ve Kültürüne Ait İzler: Mirigavati Örneği' (Kutluturk 2016: 625-645)

[10] Khan in his paper (1997) set forth that the concept of Kalki avatara has affected many sectarian movements that flourished in India particularly northern side of country. He argues that the concept of Mahdi (guide and restorer of justice) found in Ismāʿīliyyah is one of the most important factor for referring of Kalki avatara as Nakalanki in the Ginan literature.

[11] For more information on this issue see 'Batını Ekolleri Anlamada Anahtar Bir Kavram: Ezılle/Gölgeler Nazariyesi' (Avcu 2016: 117-119).

realpatidar.com